# G Model PUBREL-1439; No. of Pages 8

## ARTICLE IN PRESS

Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

## **Public Relations Review**



## The impact of think tanks on mass media discourse regarding the economic crisis in Spain

Ferran Lalueza<sup>a,\*</sup>, Ramon Girona<sup>b</sup>

- <sup>a</sup> Information and Communication Sciences Department, Open University of Catalonia, Barcelona, Spain
- <sup>b</sup> Department of Philology and Communication, University of Girona, Girona, Spain

## ARTICLE INFO

### Article history: Received 30 January 2015 Received in revised form 29 May 2015 Accepted 14 September 2015

Keywords: Think tanks Economic crisis Public relations strategies Intelligence

## ABSTRACT

Influencing mass media discourse is considered an essential part of the work carried out by think tanks. This research focuses on the influence Spanish think tanks have exercised in shaping the ubiquitous and all-pervading concept of "economic crisis" in the press of reference during 2013 and 2014. The results show that very few such entities have had even a minimally significant impact in this area, while also demonstrating that very diverse communicative strategies exist that can result in maximizing the amount of media attention gained. Consequently, despite being regarded as intelligence actors, Spanish think tanks do not seem to be so.

© 2015 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

### 1. Introduction

Even if they have not attained the critical role they play in the US, think tanks in Europe have experienced significant growth in recent years. Spain has not been unaffected by this trend, as evidenced by the growing number of organizations characterized as such.

With the emergence of new Spanish think tanks, these organizations have become the subject of study in different bodies of research, which have essentially concerned themselves with inventorying and classifying them, determining their structure and identifying their links with other relevant actors in the field of ideas and political practice, the two fields between which think tanks are called upon to build bridges.

Despite the fact that achieving media coverage has traditionally been considered the main strategy used by think tanks to influence political decisions and actions, the real impact they have on the media has scarcely been studied and, in the Spanish case, not at all. This research aims to determine to what extent the contributions of Spanish think tanks have influenced mass media discourse on a topic which, given its impact, depth and significance, has been both ubiquitous and all-pervading during the period of study: the economic crisis.

### 2. Theoretical framework

If "intelligence actors are not only those groups and individuals concerned with collecting, analyzing, and communicating information relevant to national strategic goals, but also those who utilize this information in policymaking" (Durbin, 2008, p. 16), a think tank must be regarded as an intelligence actor. After all, according to McGann (2015, p. 7), "the ongoing

E-mail addresses: flalueza@uoc.edu (F. Lalueza), ramon.girona@udg.edu (R. Girona).

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.09.006 0363-8111/© 2015 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

Please cite this article in press as: Lalueza, F., & Girona, R. The impact of think tanks on mass media discourse regarding the economic crisis in Spain. *Public Relations Review* (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.09.006

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author.

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

challenge for think tanks is to produce timely and accessible policy-oriented research that effectively engages policymakers, the press, and the public on the critical issues facing a country".

In fact, achieving media visibility is widely attributed as the goal of think tanks (Rich & Weaver, 2000; Cook, 1998; Cigler & Loomis, 1995) and they are generally considered to be having increasingly more success in this (Misztal, 2012). Moreover, it is the main indicator by means of which think tanks themselves measure their effectiveness (Abelson, 2012). Consequently, it is logical that these organizations and their actions have been addressed primarily from the perspective of political sociology and the communication sciences, and particularly by scholars of public relations and competitive intelligence (Stone, 1996; Abelson, 2006, 2009; Xifra, 2008, 2010; Castillo, 2009). Thus, together with their widespread adoption of the "the marketing of ideas" metaphor, the incorporation of marketing and public relations professionals on their staff has also become widespread (Smith, 1991).

Of all the public relations strategies that think tanks can use to mobilize public opinion in the field of political communication, the most common is that of *media relations* (Xifra, 2001), in the case of think tanks aimed at incorporating ideas, data and approaches to spread to the media agenda. Although the media visibility of European think tanks tends to be considered significantly lower than that of their North American counterparts (McGann, 2007, 2015), the fact is that the true impact of think tanks on media discourse has rarely been addressed as an object of empirical study (Rich & Weaver, 2000). In the Spanish case, the issue has not been addressed at all.

The (mostly American) literature on the topic of think tank media visibility has traditionally linked greater visibility to greater resources; that is, a higher budget and more researchers (Danielian, 1989). However, this factor is not always proportional because some organizations may become little more than an obligatory source when commenting on certain issues, due to the fact that some think tanks use particularly effective resources in disseminating information to journalists or have personal ties with those who decide which articles to include in review sections (Rich & Weaver, 2000). In addition to the above, a kind of virtuous circle has also been detected (virtuous from the standpoint of visibility, but vicious in terms of plurality), leading journalists to consistently use those experts who most regularly appear in the media (Graber, 1993).

Seniority, geographical proximity to the media on which the impact is desired and degree of ideological affinity with its editorial lines are other success factors identified by Rich and Weaver (2000). These authors also suggest that the degree to which the financing of a think tank depends on its media visibility will also determine the effort invested in its promotion.

In the context of deep crisis in which the different market economy models use public relations to try to impose their political and socio-economic precepts over their global competitors (Lawniczak, 2007), the topic of economic crisis presents itself as a sufficiently relevant and meaningful field on which to focus the analysis of Spanish think tanks' ability to influence media discourse.

## 3. Object of study, methodology and limitations

This research aims to determine the real impact achieved by Spanish think tanks on newspapers of reference in Spain, from both a quantitative and qualitative viewpoint, with regard to how the media have addressed such an all-pervading and transcendent topic as the economic crisis. *Impact* is to be understood as the raising of media coverage of the organization, of its activities, and of the ideas or the points of view it wants to spread.

In order to determine which think tanks to address as our object of study, we used as a basis previous studies that have inventoried these organizations in Spain (McGann, 2012; Tello, 2013; Barberà & Arregui, 2011; Ponsa & Xifra, 2010), although excluding those whose area of specialization was completely unrelated to economics and those which displayed almost total inactivity in the first year of their analysis. Thus, the following 27 think tanks included:

- Cercle per al Coneixement
- Círculo de Empresarios
- Consell Assessor per a la Reactivació Econòmica i el Creixement (CAREC)
- Fundación para el Análisis y los Estudios Sociales (FAES)
- Fundació Catalanista i Demócrata CATDEM
- Fundació Catalunya Oberta
- Fundación Ortega y Gasset
- Fundació Privada Centre d'Estudis Jordi Pujol
- Fundació Rafael Campalans
- Fundación Universidad Empresa (FUE)
- Fundación Alternativas
- Fundación Ciudadanía y Valores
- Fundación de Cajas de Ahorro
- Fundación de Estudios de Economía Aplicada (FEDEA)
- Fundación Ideas para el Progreso
- Fundación Independiente
- Fundación Internacional para la Libertad
- Fundación COTEC para la Innovación Tecnológica

Please cite this article in press as: Lalueza, F., & Girona, R. The impact of think tanks on mass media discourse regarding the economic crisis in Spain. *Public Relations Review* (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.09.006

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

- Fundación para las Relaciones Internacionales y el Dialogo (FRIDE)
- Fundación Sistema
- Grupo de Estudios Estratégicos
- Institución Futuro
- Instituto de Estudios Económicos
- Instituto de Estudios Fiscales
- Instituto Iuan de Mariana
- Nous Horitzons
- Real Instituto Elcano

In order to trace the media impact of these think tanks, the media analyzed were the five Spanish daily newspapers with the most readers (in the following order: *El País, El Mundo, La Vanguardia, El Periódico de Cataluña* and *ABC*), the two Spanish economic daily newspapers of reference (*Expansión* and *Cinco Dias*) and the monthly magazine *Actualidad Económica*, also a reference in this specialized field. To determine reader numbers, we used data from the *Estudio General de Medios* (General Media Study) for the last rolling year from February to November 2014. For the general daily newspapers, we omitted the newspaper *La Voz de Galicia* due to its lack of specific editions covering a wider geographical area than strictly the region of Galicia, which could have caused some distortion in the results.

Moreover, we also analyzed the impact the aforementioned think tanks have had on the journalistic content disseminated by the Europa Press news agency. In this case, however, the information obtained has been used purely as a contrasting element and has not been integrated into the results generated from analysis of the daily press, given that content from this agency is essentially aimed at those media that contract its services directly and do not therefore impact the general public.

With regard to the timeframe of the corpus, we opted to cover two full years: 2013 and 2014. From a quantitative perspective, we consider the 730 days analyzed to constitute a sufficiently representative sample of the potential media impact of think tanks. And from a more qualitative perspective, this timeframe allowed us to include a year in which the effects of the crisis seemed to have peaked (2013) and contrast it with another in which the first minimally credible evidence of a hypothetical recovery were emerging.

Using the Factiva–Reuters database, we obtained all journalistic pieces (news items, editorials, opinion articles, reports...) published during the period analyzed by the media comprising our sample alluding in some way to the studied think tanks. In our searches, the various names employed by each think tank were used to ensure the completeness of results: full name, partial name, letters or acronyms, linguistic variants other than the official name, etc. A preliminary content analysis then allowed us to discard those journalistic pieces that alluded to organizations which, despite having a similar name to the think tank under study (or occasionally even the same one), in fact alluded to completely distinct organizations.

After segregating the journalistic corpus truly referring to the think tanks object of study, we proceeded with a more in-depth content analysis that allowed us to discriminate between texts including some reference to the economic crisis and/or its causes and consequences from those unconnected to the topic. To systematize the data gathering of those pieces addressing the topic of the crisis (and its corresponding sub-topics), a form was used listing the most relevant information for each:

- Medium
- Date of publication
- Specific thematic focus
- Type of contribution made by the think tank to the content of the journalistic piece analyzed

The methodology used has two inherent limitations that we would highlight here.

The first is that we have not considered impacts obtained via the audiovisual media. In this regard, however, it is worth bearing in mind that the nature of the activity carried out by think tanks, conceived as factories of ideas with a genuine vocation to influence, suggests that their communicative action tends to be concentrated mainly in the written press of reference, which allows them to develop more complex, innovative and relevant concepts in the required detail, and is also traditionally attributed a clearer influencing role among the political and economic elites. Furthermore, unlike the case of the US, Spanish television offers programs which are much less likely to award a voice to think tank spokespeople.

The second methodological limitation is that we were able to trace the more transparent impact of think tanks, but not a hypothetical rogue impact, if indeed there was any, in which the authorship of certain ideas, approaches or contributions was not made explicit. It is conceivable, however, that organizations that assume the label of think tank do so to acquire extra credibility which does not seem consistent or compatible with the practice of making anonymous contributions. In any case, the same limitation has also been assumed by authors of reference such as Abelson (2006).

## 4. Results

During 2013 and 2014, the eight general and economic media of reference analyzed alluded to one of the 27 think tanks object of our study in 1997 journalistic pieces. Of these, only 293 touched on the issue of the economic crisis, either explicitly or tangentially. Table 1 summarizes these general results.

Please cite this article in press as: Lalueza, F., & Girona, R. The impact of think tanks on mass media discourse regarding the economic crisis in Spain. *Public Relations Review* (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.09.006

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

**Table 1**Media impact by each think tank object of study.

Think tanks	No. of media impacts	No. of media impacts linked to the crisis
Cercle per al Coneixement	5	1
Círculo de Empresarios	377	37
Consell Assessor per a la Reactivació Econòmica i el Creixement (CAREC)	14	6
Fundación para el Análisis y los Estudios Sociales (FAES)	49	2
Fundació Catalanista i Demócrata – CATDEM	108	0
Fundació Catalunya Oberta	6	1
Fundación Ortega y Gasset	23	0
Fundació Privada Centre d'Estudis Jordi Pujol	33	0
Fundació Rafael Campalans	56	1
Fundación Universidad-Empresa (FUE)	19	9
Fundación Alternativas	127	27
Fundación Ciudadanía y Valores	11	0
Fundación de Cajas de Ahorros (Funcas)	45	18
Fundación de Estudios de Economía Aplicada (FEDEA)	180	59
Fundación Ideas para el Progreso	99	2
Fundación Independiente	4	0
Fundación Internacional para la Libertad	3	2
Fundación COTEC para la Innovación Tecnológica	49	18
Fundación para las Relaciones Internacionales y el Dialogo (FRIDE)	6	0
Fundación Sistema	9	1
Grupo de Estudios Estratégicos	3	1
Institución Futuro	4	1
Instituto de Estudios Económicos	364	56
Instituto de Estudios Fiscales	160	10
Instituto Juan de Mariana	41	9
Nous Horitzons	15	1
Real Instituto Elcano	187	31
Totals	1,997	293

From the research conducted, we also observe that only 21 of the 27 think tanks studied ended up influencing, to a greater or lesser extent, the content that the written press of reference devoted to the economic crisis during 2013–2014. Below we provide details of the scope of these contributions by each of the 21 think tanks that did manage to impact the press' treatment of the economic crisis.

### 4.1. Cercle per al Coneixement

This think tank had only one media impact linked to the economic crisis. It was a news item regarding the prize the think tank annually awards to the most innovative Catalan firm. The award-winning firm is presented by the president of Cercle per al Coneixement, whose statements are contained in this news item, as an example of a firm capable of overcoming the crisis.

## 4.2. Círculo de Empresarios

This is the third largest think tank in number of media impacts on the economic crisis, with a total of 37. The impacts derive from a wide range of actions including the following: co-promotion of the Barómetro de los Círculos (barometer of circles), conceived as a national and international reference in assessing Spanish competitiveness and as a basis to support recommendations to help overcome the crisis; qualifying the government budgets for 2014 as a "disincentive", "burden" and "unambitious"; disseminating the annual report La empresa mediana española ("the medium-sized Spanish firm"), which concluded that any medium-sized Spanish company that has withstood the crisis has become more productive, innovative and international, and which at times serves as a pretext to award a voice to the president of the think tank and disseminate his economic prescriptions against the crisis; disseminating a report urging action be taken over the oversized public administration; promoting the presence of the think tank's executives at acts of economic importance, and organizing in turn events that count on the participation of leading figures from the economic field (such as the governor of the Bank of Spain). Moreover, among the recommendations made by this think tank more or less recurrently are reduction of the minimum wage (this recommendation had been made a year before the publication of various news items that alluded to it, but was revisited when the International Monetary Fund and the European Commission launched a similar petition and particularly disturbing youth unemployment figures were published), the reduction of labor, logistics and energy costs; fostering freelance work and part-time contracts; the reduction of direct taxes and increasing indirect taxes; reducing social security contributions, and reducing unemployment benefits and pensions. In addition to news items alluding to these actions and recommendations, the Círculo de Empresarios also achieves media presence via opinion pieces written by its

Please cite this article in press as: Lalueza, F., & Girona, R. The impact of think tanks on mass media discourse regarding the economic crisis in Spain. *Public Relations Review* (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.09.006

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

president, members of its executive team and advisory board or analysts not explicitly linked to the organization but who refer to some of its recipes for exiting the crisis. Additionally, it ensures that its proposals are included in two editorials.

## 4.3. Consell Assessor per a la Reactivació Econòmica i el Creixement (CAREC)

This think tank had a total of 6 media impacts linked to the economic crisis. These impacts derived from the following: disseminating a report that recommends various measures to combat financing difficulties faced by firms; disseminating a report on tax evasion and the underground economy; disseminating a report that detects some political paralysis in addressing the crisis in Catalonia and Spain in general, and proposes the creation of German-style "minijobs". Symptomatically, all of the impacts achieved by this think tank are concentrated in one medium (*El Periódico de Cataluña*) and in half of the cases it is the same writer that refers to its reports and recommendations.

### 4.4. Fundación para el Análisis y los Estudios Sociales (FAES)

This think tank, with direct links to the ruling party in Spain during the period analyzed, only achieved two impacts linked to the economic crisis. One is a news story that echoes the appeal launched by the FAES to the Spanish government to reduce dismissal costs and the minimum wage, and to make access to unemployment benefits more difficult. The second news item refers to the summer camp organized by this think tank, with the presence of the German finance minister whose statements support the Spanish government's anti-crisis reforms.

## 4.5. Fundació Catalunya Oberta

The only media impact linked to the crisis achieved by this think tank refers to its participation in the translation of a book by a *Financial Times* analyst outlining a new international order following the crisis of 2008.

## 4.6. Fundació Rafael Campalans

The only media impact linked to the crisis achieved by this think tank focuses on its "Social Report", which warns of a higher growth in inequality in Catalonia than in the rest of Spain.

## 4.7. Fundación Universidad-Empresa (FUE)

This think tank achieved a total of nine media impacts linked to the economic crisis. Of these, only one responds to the genuine activity of a think tank as a laboratory of ideas, related to a study by the FUE and the Conference of University Social Councils detecting estrangement between science and the market due to the prevalence of basic and non-oriented research. The remaining eight allude to initiatives against youth unemployment in which the organization itself participated: scholarships, job portal, forums, internship programs, startup programs, etc.

## 4.8. Fundación Alternativas

This think tank, linked to the main opposition party in Spain during the analyzed period (PSOE), achieved 27 impacts linked to the economic crisis. Its report on migration among Spaniards due to the crisis generated considerable coverage, as did its study denouncing the current accommodating nature of unemployment benefits and analyzing the impact of the crisis on the most vulnerable groups. The interference of international organizations in Spanish politics, the decline of social democracy in Europe, the fall in tax revenue in Spain and growing inequalities are other themes this think tank presents in the media. Both opinion pieces written by executives or contributors to Fundación Alternativas and opinion articles written by journalists unrelated to the think tank but based on its reports are found in a single newspaper: *El País*. In informative news items, on the other hand, it appears in a greater diversity of media.

## 4.9. Fundación de Cajas de Ahorros (Funcas)

This think tank achieved a total of 18 media impacts linked to the economic crisis. Most of these impacts stem from economic indicators provided to the media by this organization's research service: estimates related to expected growth, the CPI, deficit, debt, family, employment, interest rates, the underground economy, etc. From a more qualitative perspective, Funcas also used the media to warn of growing inequalities between autonomous regions and the particularly poignant impact of the crisis on the middle class.

## 4.10. Fundación de Estudios de Economía Aplicada (FEDEA)

This is the top think tank in terms of number of media impacts achieved on the economic crisis, with a total of 59. Most of these impacts come from studies carried out by its *Observatorio Laboral* (labor observatory), dedicated to the study of

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

employment and its evolution. Its proposal to promote a "single contract" also generated notable media coverage. Other studies by the think tank appearing in the media focused on the budgets of the autonomous regions, public debt, the underground economy, tax evasion and increasing inequalities. FEDEA also achieved a certain amount of media attention via the publishing of a book, certain contents of its blog, the participation of one of its members in a group of experts which the Spanish government commissioned to study the sustainability of the pension system, and the launch of a program against youth unemployment.

## 4.11. Fundación Ideas para el Progreso

This think tank achieved just two media impacts linked to the economic crisis. One is related to the political background of the economic crisis in Spain, according to analysis by the director of the Foundation. The other refers to a conference organized by the think tank with a large representation of socialist leaders analyzing the political impact of the crisis.

## 4.12. Fundación Internacional para la Libertad

This think tank only achieved two media impacts linked to the economic crisis. In fact, both referred to the same event: the organization of a conference in Argentina with the participation of a leader of the ruling Spanish Popular Party presenting his personal view on the crisis and the best way to stop it.

## 4.13. Fundación COTEC para la Innovación Tecnológica

This think tank achieved 18 media impacts linked to the economic crisis. The vast majority of these impacts refer to a study by the organization that highlights the negative impact of the crisis on Spanish investment in R&D+i. Also, a couple of other news items focus on some initiatives (meetings, presentations) organized by the Foundation.

### 4.14. Fundación Sistema

This think tank had just one media impact linked to the economic crisis, referring to the statements by a socialist leader during the presentation of a book published by the organization.

## 4.15. Grupo de Estudios Estratégicos

This think tank also had just one media impact linked to the economic crisis, an opinion piece that reflects its position, which focuses on the idea that the crisis should not lead to Spain letting its guard down with regard to security and defense.

## 4.16. Institución Futuro

This think tank also had just one media impact linked to the economic crisis. It referred to statements made by a platform on which the organization is present, urging the fight against corruption, as it penalizes a citizenry already hard hit by the crisis.

## 4.17. Instituto de Estudios Económicos

This is the second ranking think tank in terms of number of media impacts achieved on the economic crisis, with a total of 56. Most of these impacts stem from the economic indicators provided to the media by this organization regarding: unemployment, growth forecasts, and savings and household spending. The publication of a study on the banking sector also achieves some impact, as do the proposal to reduce social security contributions, promote labor reform to simplify the hiring process and lower unemployment benefits, delay retirement until age 70 and reduced wages. One notable peculiarity of this think tank is that it repeatedly achieves media presence by disseminating data not from its own studies but from studies carried out by third parties, particularly European bodies.

## 4.18. Instituto de Estudios Fiscales

This think tank achieved ten media impacts linked to the economic crisis. The vast majority allude to its proposal to reduce pensions by up to 45% to ensure sustainability, and the adverse reactions this proposal received (including from the Spanish Minister of Economy). Figures released by the organization on the underground economy, unemployment and growth also receive some media attention, as does the tax model proposed by a former director of the Institute.

Please cite this article in press as: Lalueza, F., & Girona, R. The impact of think tanks on mass media discourse regarding the economic crisis in Spain. *Public Relations Review* (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2015.09.006

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

### 4.19. Instituto Juan de Mariana

This think tank achieved nine media impacts linked to the economic crisis. Although there is quite a diverse thematic focus (family savings, credit bubble, minimum wage, stock market fluctuations, mortgage non-payment,...), what these impacts have in common is the role of the think tank's director, whether through statements, references to the publication of a book of which he is the author, opinion articles written by him or allusions to his views in articles written by others.

#### 4.20. Nous Horitzons

This think tank achieved only one media impact linked to the economic crisis, referring to a conference it co-organized on cuts and austerity.

### 4.21. Real Instituto Elcano

This think tank achieved 31 media impacts linked to the economic crisis. The most stand-out topics were Spanish emigration caused by the crisis and the impact of the crisis on the Spain brand, although other themes also include the sovereign debt crisis, youth unemployment, falling exports, reduced energy consumption caused by the crisis, the impact of the crisis on Spanish Euroscepticism (considered "Eurofrustration") and the risk of deflation. All contributions by this think tank are based on studies it has conducted or analysis by its researchers.

## 5. Discussion and conclusions

The data suggest that very few Spanish think tanks actually have even a minimally significant impact on media discourse on the economic crisis. Of the 27 organizations analyzed, three account for more than half of the impacts (51.8%), while 16 move within the range of 0–2 impacts. This very limited influence on the media is in tune with the findings of research conducted by Barberà and Arregui (2011), who determined that Spanish think tanks tend to foster direct contact with relevant political actors rather than achieving this via the media. In addition, within the context of a severe and prolonged economic crisis, the urgency with which it is expected that certain corrective policy measures are implemented may discourage the use of public relations strategies linked to the think tanks in favor of lobbying strategies, which by definition pursue a more immediate result (Leeson, Ryan, & Williamson, 2012).

Furthermore, having explicit links to a political party does not appear to make a difference when it comes to achieving more or less participatory share in the media agenda on economic crisis. Although the three think tanks which achieve most impacts do not have particularly obvious links to political parties, the two think tanks of reference for the ruling party (FAES) and the main opposition party (Fundación Alternativas) obtain very different results. In this respect, we could venture a hypothesis that the greater the public awareness of a relationship between a think tank and a political party, the less attractive this think tank is as a source to the media, meaning that the most decisive factor may not a real between dependence party and think tank but rather the perception of that dependence.

One strategy that reveals itself as being particularly productive for think tanks in achieving media influence is that of identifying a specific thematic niche and appropriating it, thus becoming almost unignorable references and leading to the media using them consistently when addressing content related to that subject area. This is the case with the Fundación de Cajas de Ahorros and the most important economic indicators (particularly growth projections), the Fundación de Estudios de Economía Aplicada and its analysis of the evolution of employment, and the Fundación COTEC para la Innovación Tecnológica with its studies on the decline in R&D+i investment due to the crisis.

An opposite to the model one mentioned above, but also revealing itself as being reasonably effective in terms of achieving media coverage is that of the "multi-thematic" think tank, whose presence in the media is not bound by a specific topic but rather based on the personality-centered role adopted by one of its spokespeople and his or her capacity to act as a source in diverse subject areas. This model would be clearly embodied by the Instituto Juan de Mariana and its director Juan Ramón Rallo. According to Rich and Weaver (2000), although think tanks of this type do not fall within the so-called "usual suspects" or almost obligatory sources to be consulted, they do benefit from the convenience for journalists in being able to turn to a single source to address several different issues.

Another very effective strategy for a think tank to achieve media coverage consists in proposing a wide range of anticrisis recipes, covering many different areas of the economy (employment, pensions, tax, contributions,...). In fact, it does not seem necessary to demonstrate that these recommendations are supported by solid studies and research, but rather the media reproduce them almost systematically on the basis of where they come from. This is the case with the Círculo de Empresarios, for example.

Regarding the interest of the media themselves, they seek data, information and opinions. Those think tanks that are not able to provide this tend to be excluded from journalistic content or relegated to little more than anecdotal news items. If they do provide it, however, it is relatively easy for them to take center stage, even when they acknowledge that their contributions are not homegrown but taken from reports by third parties. Given the fact that Spanish think tanks have an exclusively domestic approach to the economic crisis, these reports, taken for instance from European bodies, are almost the only way to tackle the issue from an international point of view.

′

F. Lalueza, R. Girona / Public Relations Review xxx (2015) xxx-xxx

The data also suggest that although not a widespread model, some atypical think tanks, contrary to what might be expected of a laboratory of ideas, achieve more impact from what they do (scholarship programs, projects for entrepreneurs, online portals...) than what they say. Thus there is the paradox that they achieve significant media coverage when in reality they barely generate their own discourse in the media. This is the case with the Fundación Universidad-Empresa.

Some think tanks seem to have their "go-to media", in which representatives of the organization write opinion pieces and/or columnists consistently use reports and studies they have produced. This is the case with the Consell Assessor per a la Reactivació Econòmica i el Creixement (CAREC) in *El Periódico de Cataluña* and the Fundación Alternativas in the newspaper *El País*. This phenomenon of media coverage based on ideological affinities was first described by Rich and Weaver (2000).

Finally, those media not particularly prone to including contributions by a particular think tank whose stance is distant from its own editorial line do not hesitate to incorporate them when they do coincide ideologically at some time. This is the case with the Fundación Alternativas, which is close to the socialist party line and has little prestige in the more conservative media but achieved notable coverage in the latter (particularly in the newspaper *Expansión*) when defending harder postulates regarding social unemployment policy.

## Acknowledgements

This paper presents some of the results of a R&D project funded by the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness (project ECO2012-34490).

### References

Abelson, D. (2006). A capitol idea. Think tanks & US foreign policy. Montreal: McGill-Oueen's University Press,

Abelson, D. (2009). Do think tanks matter? Assessing the impact of public policy institutes. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Abelson, D. E. (2012). Think-tanks, social democracy and social policy. Parliamentary Affairs, 66(4), 894-902.

Barberà, P., & Arregui, J. (2011). Naturaleza e influencia de los think tanks en el proceso político en España. Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials (Universitat Autónoma de Barcelona). Working Papers.

Castillo, A., 2009. Relaciones públicas y think tanks en América Latina: Estudio sobre su implantación y acción. *Razón y Palabra*, 70. Retrieved September 16, 2014, from http://www.razonypalabra.org.mx/Castillo\_revisado2.pdf.

Cigler, A. J., & Loomis, B. A. (1995). Contemporary interest group politics: more than more of the same. In A. J. Cigler, & B. A. Loomis (Eds.), *Interest group politics*. Washington, D.C: Congressional Quarterly Press.

Cook, T. E. (1998). Governing with the news. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Danielian, L. H. (1989). Network news coverage of interest groups: implications for mass media and democracy (Ph. D. dissertation). Austin: University of Texas.

Durbin, B. M. (2008). Changing the guard: the politics of U.S. intelligence policy (Ph. D. dissertation). Berkeley: University of California.

Graber, D. A. (1993). Mass media and American politics. Washington, D.C: Congressional Quarterly Press.

Lawniczak, R. (2007). Re-examining the economic roots of public relations. Public Relations Review, 35, 346-352.

Leeson, P. T., Ryan, M. E., & Williamson, C. R. (2012). Think tanks. *Journal of Comparative Economics*, 40, 62–77.

McGann, J. G. (2007). Think tanks and policy advice in the United States: academics, advisors and advocates. New York: Routledge.

McGann, J. G. (2012). 2012 Global go to think tank index report. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania. Retrieved March 21, 2013.

http://repository.upenn.edu/think\_tanks/7

McGann, J. G., 2015. 2014 Global go to think tank index report. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania. Retrieved January 23, 2015, from http://repository.upenn.edu/think.tanks/8.

Misztal, B. A. (2012). Public intellectuals and think tanks: a free market in ideas? International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society, 25(4), 127-141.

Ponsa, F., & Xifra, J. (2010). Guia de think tanks a Catalunya. Barcelona: Sehen.

Rich, A., & Weaver, R. K. (2000). Think tanks in the U.S. media. The International Journal of Press/Politics, 5(4), 81-103.

Smith, J. A. (1991). The idea brokers: think tanks and the rise of the new policy elite. New York: Free Press.

Stone, D. (1996). Capturing the political imagination: think tanks and the policy process. London: Frank Cass.

Tello, M. (2013). Guía de think Tanks en España. Madrid: Fundación Ciudadanía y Valores.

Xifra, J. (2001). Relacions públiques i comunicació política. Bellaterra: Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (Ph. D. dissertation).

Xifra, J. (2008). Los think tanks. Barcelona: Editorial UOC.

Xifra, J. (2010). Els think tanks en les campanyes electorals i en la campanya electoral espanyola. In J. M. Terricabras, & J. Xifra (Eds.), Retòrica, màrqueting d'idees i legitimació política. Girona: Documenta Universitària.

Q